International Journal of Social Science and Humanities Research ISSN 2348-3164 (online) Vol. 10, Issue 2, pp: (51-58), Month: April - June 2022, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

EVALUATING THE EFFECTS OF INSECURITY ON HOSPITALITY INDUSTRY IN NORTHERN NIGERIA (2014-2019)

AJAYI, E.A.¹, OJO, S.S², JIMOH, D.M³, CHINANSA, J.⁴

^{1,3,4} Department of Hospitality Management, School of Science and Technology, Kaduna Polytechnic, Kaduna Nigeria
²Department of Sociology, Federal University Gashua, Gashua Nigeria

Abstract: The study examined the effect of insecurity on the hotel patronage in Northern Nigeria with a specific focus on Borno, Adamawa and Katsina States. The states in particular & Nigeria, as a country, is faced with the challenges of terrorism acts such as bombings, bandit, kidnapping, armed robbery as well as ethno-religious conflicts which all have dangerous potentials of turning states and the country fortune as one of the tourist destinations of choice in the world. Four (4) research questions, guided the study. The population of the study consisted of three hundred (300) staff from four (4) selected hotels from each state. The sample size for the study was one hundred and seventy-one (171) from the population of (300) using Taro Yemen's formula. Data were collected using questionnaire and observation through the media. Data were analyzed using the descriptive method. The findings of the study indicate that insecurity has dangerous implications on Northern states, hospitality industry as well as on the entire country as a destination. Based on the findings, therefore, it was recommended that the circumstances which give rise to terrorism be looked into and addressed particularly through the public and private partnership.

Keywords: Evaluating, Effects, Insecurity, Hospitality, Industry, Northern Nigeria.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of Study

Africans the most populous country Nigeria is presently embroidered in a security crisis which has become an unending to most business sectors such as the hospitality sectors where hotels fall under. This trend has led to mockery of the effort of law enforcement agents and the millions of naira annually budgeted by the government for security of people and business in Nigeria (Emmanuel *et al.*, 2019). The situation is worst in the north-western states of Nigeria where people are scared to travel to and even residents flee for their safety. The security challenge keeps taking new dimensions and has head-long posed as a threat to the development of business, especially hotel patronage, which before now was a big business with visitors from both in and out of Nigeria (Innocent, 2016). Tourism and hospitality industries are one of the worlds' largest sectors on the term of generating revenue and paying of taxes amounting to over 10% of Gross Domestic Products (GDP) (Cooper *et al.*, 2015) and giving jobs to a large numbers of people, also the industry has improved the labour market (Employment market) as jobs created directly increased at 1.2 million compared to 651,000, in 2016 (1.6%) resulting to 1.8% of total employment in the country. It should be noted that there was an estimated rise by 4.7% by the end of 2018 to approximately 1.3 million jobs (1.8% of total employment) (Travel Jumia, 2019).

Vol. 10, Issue 2, pp: (51-58), Month: April - June 2022, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

Factors that determine hotel patronage, includes the availability of infrastructure, security, economy and the popularity of the hotel site (Wall and Mathieson, 2015). The hotel which is the backbone of many-nation's economy cannot thrive in an environment of insecurity (Suleiman, 2015). The hotel is an attractive activity which is important to the lives of many people. The security challenges currently bedeviling Northern Nigeria is having an adverse effect on the hospitality industry in the country as companies in the sector are recording decline patronage and profits. Even countries now warn their citizens not to travel to these states. Companies and businesses in the Northern part of the country has been threatened by insecurity and consequently many have closed down operation (Okonkwoet al., 2015).

1.2 Statement of Research Problem

Nigeria has been witnessing unprecedented levels of insecurity, from armed robbery, terrorism, banditry to kidnappings. Insecurity has become a serious challenge confronting the nation and therefore it has drawn substantial allocation from national budget (Achumba & Akpor, 2016). This menace especially in the northern states of Borno, Adamawa and Katsina states of Nigeria, hasgreatly affected business activities in the region. Insecurity constitutes a major threat to investors.

The extent of lives and properties destroyed by recent insurgency activities cannot be quantified. The constant abduction, bombing and bandits organized by religious militants recognized as armed groups in northern Nigeria take a disturbing dimension. As a result, many companies and businesses are closing down in their numbers in northern Nigeria and moved to other African countries (Achummba et al, 2013). Again, insecurity affects not only foreign direct investment, but also confidence in domestic business establishment.

1.3 Aim and Objective

The study set out to investigate the impact of insecurity on the hospitality industry in northern Nigeria, especially as it affects Borno, Adamawa and Katsina states. The specific objectives include:

- i. To determine how hotel businesses have fared from the year 2014 2019
- ii. To determine the effect insecurity has had on the Hotel patronage in the states of Borno, Adamawa and Katsina
- iii. To find out the roles of government and private operators in securing hotel businesses.

1.4 Research Questions

To enable the researchers attain the above objectives, the following questions were set to guide the study

- 1. How has hotel business fared from the year 2014 2019?
- 2. What impact insecurity has had on hotel patronage in these states, Borno, Adamawa and Katsina?
- 3. Has the government and private operators being making efforts in securing hotel businesses both private and government owned?

2. LITERATURE

2.1 Hospitality industryin Nigeria

Analysis at Agusto & Co estimate that turnover for Nigeria's hotel industry in 2014 stood at 562 billion naira, the bulk of which was generated from hotel rooms. In specific terms, Nigeria tourism and hospitality industry has gone through different stages. There is paucity of evidence of the growth of hospitality industry for lack of proper recording keeping. The first sets of hospitality establishment were owned and run by Nigeria government and located at seaport, the next most important development phase of hospitality industry in Nigeria is the introduction of different institution such as the guesthouse, hotels, canteens and clubs. Hospitality in Nigeria has been largely government driven except the pre-colonial times. This has made hospitality development in Nigeria different from the way it is run in other countries like the USA, UK, and South Africa that have successful hospitality industries (Ofobruku, 2013). The growth and development in number and quality of hospitality business is significant in Nigeria and cannot be over emphasized. This is because the availability of comfortable and safe accommodation constituent a determinant in a tourists' decision to visit particular destination hospitality, business account for about 50% of the tourism expenditure and therefore countries around the world are expanding and adapting their hospitality enterprises to satisfy the home away from the market in the tourism

Vol. 10, Issue 2, pp: (51-58), Month: April - June 2022, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

business (Ofobruku, 2013). Nigeria though geopolitically disconnected and deficient in infrastructure, have been practicing tourism even during the pre-colonial and colonial era. This is exhibited in it diverse cultures, cultural sites and natural habitats and develop new tourist destination. The scope of Nigerian tourism is as great as her landmass and sizes.

Hospitality has contributed immensely to economic development based on investment from the private sector. One problem stand as a challenge to the development of the Hospitality industry in any country and this is insecurity.

Hospitality refers to both host and guest brought together in a mutual relationship which could be seen as the courteous and general reception given to guest or strangers. It can be inferred from the definition that the business of hospitality must include services. Security on the other hand is correlated with the reduction of threats to shore values which involves the ability to pursue cherished political and social ambitions (Williams, 2008). Security has been identified as one of the five global forces that would drive the Nigeria Hospitality industry to achieve millennium development goals (MDGs) (Dada, 2011). Many guests and the tourist who stay in a hotel at any destination might be vulnerable to robbery, assault, rape, and fire within the premises. According to Rotimi et al, (2013), the security situation in Nigeria has become a challenge for investors, and the economy of many of the affected Northern state in Nigeria are dwindling with implication on job losses. Rotimi et al, (2013), reports the present insecurity in the Northern part of this great country has ruined the economy of Borno, Adamawa and Katsina state respectively. Security according to Brons (2001) covers a wide range of factors; individual physical safety from other people; legal, economic and social protection; political and military stability and certainty or confidence in the value system in which the individual is embedded similarly. At the empirical level according to Alemika (2012), security may be defined and measured as the absence of harm, fear and want.

As Alemika (2012) argued there are various forms of insecurity which can be classified under four dimensions. These are, public insecurity – violent personal and property crimes; public insecurity-violent conflicts, insurgency and terrorism, economic insecurity-poverty, unemployment, social insecurity, illiteracy, ignorance, diseases or illness; human right-violation-denial of fundamental right by state and non-refers to the breach of people of this study, insecurity refers to breach of peace and security, whether-historical, religions, ethno-regional, civil, social, economic and political that has contributed to recurring conflicts and impacted enormously to the downgrade of Nigeria.

Effects of Insecurity on Hotel Patronage

Security was an important requirement for attracting foreign visitors. According to a United Nation World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO) survey (2011), 66% of vacation travelers say crime is an important consideration when choosing a vacation destination, and 62% of travelers thinking about traveling plan. As tourism grows, safety becomes more important and travelers expect protection of transportation and accommodation. If there is uncertainty, the hotel will run into problems to impact sales. Another threat of anxiety affecting the hospitality and tourism industry was the crisis in Maiduguri on February 18, 2013, which claimed many lives and lossof properties that prevented people from visiting Maiduguri. Many people, and even those living in Maiduguri, have left the state due to security conditions and some visitors are exchanging homes. Use the home exchange program instead of the hotel or stay with your loved ones.

Despite Nigeria's powerful cultural assets and rich natural beauty, the Bokoharam rebellion in the northeast keeps domestic and foreign investors away from national attractions.

An ongoing terrorist attacks has reduced passenger traffic to the embarrassed northeast. In other words, visitors flee from attractions such as the famous Argungu Fishing Festival, Yankari Game Reserve, Highlands, Othman Danfodio Tomb, Emir of Kano palace, Kainji Lake National Park, Gashaka Gumti, Okomu, Chad basin, and also Kamuku.

Indeed, security warnings have been repeatedly issued by Western and Asian countries, discouraging most tourists from visiting Nigeria, particularly the northern part. The north is vulnerable to terrorist attacks. Rebellion, robbery and kidnapping have severely disrupted the flow of international tourists to Nigeria in recent years, with having a negative impact on the country's economy.

Roles of Government and Private Operators in Ensuring Security

Review of the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat) (2007) (2005) and (1997), showed many kinds of answers for crimes and violence issues, with the evidence of the most successful, standardized are people based and not on experience in other places. In addition, it has been explained that these answers can be classified in six broad approach groups as follows.

Vol. 10, Issue 2, pp: (51-58), Month: April - June 2022, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

- a. Improving Urban Security by effective City planning, design, and governance
- b. Community-based approach to urban safety and safety improvement
- c. strengthening formal Criminal Justice System and Police Enhancement
- d. Reduction of risk factors
- e. Nonviolent dispute resolution
- f. Strengthening social capital

Theoretical framework - Human Security Approach

The human security approach introduced in the 1994 Global Human Development Report (HDR) broadened the scope of security beyond the narrow definitions of territorial protection of nation-states from external aggression to encompasses widespread and cross-cutting challenges to survival, livelihoods, and dignity of people across the world. This new perspective to security that hinged on the human rights approach broadens the concept of security to incorporate issues such as the 'freedom from want', 'freedom from fear', and 'freedom to live in dignity'. Central to human security approach, hence, is the idea that people have the right to live in freedom and dignity, free from poverty and despair...with an opportunity to enjoy all their rights fully develop their human potential (United Nation, 2012).

The human security approach underscores the interconnectedness of threats and responses to threats by recognizing that all threats are interlinked. Drawing from the foregoing, the human security approach is adopted as the theoretical and analytical framework for the study. It is because it provides the analytical perspectives and tools for a people-oriented, comprehensive, and context-specific analysis of all dimensions of security.

3. METHODOLOGY

This study used survey design to gather the views of hospitality industry experts and other key stakeholders on security issues affecting the hospitality industry in northern Nigeria.

The survey will be conducted in the states of Borno, Adamawa and Katsina. Borno, with its capital in Maiduguri, was founded in 1976 from the division of the northeastern unit of Nigeria, and was further divided into two states in 1991: Borno and what is now Yobe. Borno is made up of 27 Local Government areas divided into three Senatorial districts with a population of 4,944,000 (2006 census). Adamawa is a state in Northern-Eastern Nigeria with its capital at Yola. Adamawa state consists of twenty-one Local Government areas with a population of 3,178,950, (2006 census). The Katsina state is a state in the North-West zone of Nigeria, its capital is Katsina. The Katsina state consists of Thirty-four (34) Local Government areas with a population of 5,801,584, (2006 census).

The population of the study consists of all the commercial hotels located in the state capitals of the three selected states namely; Borno, Adamawa and Katsina states. Maiduguri (20), Yola (70) and Katsina (30) respectively. However, 10% of the total no of hotels in the three states were chosen for the study and it resulted into (12) hotels. Staffs in Borno selected hotels (100), Adamawa selected hotels (90), while Katsina selected hotels (110) totaling 300 which represents the study population (The Hotels Nigeria Website Survey, 2019). The sample size for the study is 171 drawn from the population of the study of 300 using Taro Yemeni's formula.

The major instrument used in the collection of data for this research work is questionnaires which are used to obtain information from the staff of the selected hotels on how insecurity has affected hotel patronage. The data collected through the questionnaire was analysed using simple percentage and mean statistic.

4. DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

The data collected for this study was statically analyzed in a table format and presented based on the findings from the research questionnaires. The population for the study comprise of staff of the selected hotels under study. A total number of 171 copies of questionnaires were distributed to the staff of the selected hotels. 120 questionnaires were filled and returned to the researchers, 30 questionnaires were discarded because it was not properly filled, while 21 copies could not be retrieved.

Vol. 10, Issue 2, pp: (51-58), Month: April - June 2022, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

The items in the questionnaire were formed based on the research objectives in chapter one. These items were analyzed using the 5point Likert scale. The variables used in the questionnaire were: Strongly Agreed (SA) -5 points; Agree (A)-4 points; Undecided (U)-3 points; Disagreed (D)-2 points; Strongly disagreed (SD)-1 point; The Decision Rule is given by Rating Scale (RS) 5 = 5 + 4 + 3 + 2 + 1/5 = 15/5 = 3 Decision rule = 3.0. Thus, items that have mean value below 3.0 were rejected while items that have value mean value of 3.0 and above were accepted.

Section A: Personal Data

Table 4.1.1: Analysis of Respondents according to Age

Options	Frequency	Percentage				
18 - 24	35	29				
25 – 40	45	38				
41 – 50	25	21				
51 and above	15	12.5				
Total	120	100				

Source: Research Field Survey 2019

The above tables shows that 35 respondents representing 29% are within the age of 18 - 24, 45 respondents representing 38 are within the age range of 25 - 40 years, 25 respondents representing 21% are within the age range of 51 and above, which indicates that staff within the age range of 25 - 40 are employed than the other age range.

Table 4.1.2: Analysis of Respondents According to their Gender

Options	Frequency	Percentage
Male	100	83
Female	20	16
Total	120	100

Source: Researcher Field Survey 2019

Abovetable shows that 100 respondents 83% are male 20 respondents representing 16% are female which indicates that, most staffs in the hotel are males.

Table 4.1.3: Analysis of respondents according to their Marital Status

Options	Frequency	Percentage
Single	98	81
Married	22	18
Total	120	100

Source: Researcher Field Survey 2019

The above shows that 98 respondents representing 81% are the single 22 respondents representing 18% are married, and none are divorced which indicates that, most staffs in the hotel are married.

Table 4.1.4: Analysis of respondents according to their educational qualification

Options	Frequency	Percentage
ND/NCE	40	33
BSC/HND	20	16.6
Others	60	33
Total	120	100

Source: Researcher Field Survey 2019

Vol. 10, Issue 2, pp: (51-58), Month: April - June 2022, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

The above shows that 20 respondents representing 33% are ND/NCE holders, 20 respondents representing 16.5% are B.SC/HND holders and 60 respondents representing 33% are not educated, which indicates that most staffs are not really educated.

Table 4.2.1: Analysis Determination of how the hotel has fared from the year 2014-2019

S/No	Statement	5	4	3	2	1	Mean	Remarks
		SA	A	D	U	SD	X	
1	Foreign visitors looking for hot destination to travel to totally left out Nigeria because of insecurity	50	30	5	5	0	3.3	Agreed
2	Several activities that encourage touristsare no longer being engaged in because of insecurity	60	20	10	0	5	3.5	Agreed
3	Hotel business has been rough in Nigeria. The once booming hospitality business has drastically declined.	40	10	5	10	5	2.3	Undecided
4	The growth of Hospitality industry is declining because of low patronage as a result of insecurity	80	5	0	4	0	3.6	Strongly agreed
5	The Hospitality patronage during these periods(2014-2019) for foreign visitors dropped drastically	95	10	0	10	0	4.6	Strongly agreed
	Grand mean						3.5	Strongly agreed

Source: Research Field Survey (2019)

Table 4.1.4 from the above table, it shows that most of the respondents strongly agreed that hospitality industry have not fared well from the year 2014 - 2019.

Table 4.2.2 Analysis on the Effect of Insecurity on Hotel Patronage

S/No	Statement	5	4	3	2	1	Mean	Remarks
		SA	A	D	U	SD	X	
6	Uncertainty Significantly Reduces Hotel Service Sales	70	30	5	0	0	4.0	Strongly agreed
7	When hotels face security threats, revenue generation exacerbates	80	15	10	2	2	4.1	Strongly agreed
8	There is the shortage of staff due to relocation caused by insecurity	95	10	5	1	1	4.5	Strongly agreed
9	Hotels end up folding up when the security threat is high	120	5	1	0	0	4.5	Strongly agreed
10	Insecurity undermines the public / private sector's ability to support hospitality and tourism development	100	5	5	0	0	4.0	Strongly agreed
11	Residents of Adamawa and Bornoare leaving the states due to security conditions	60	15	10	0	0	4.0	Strongly agreed
12	Bako Haram/Bandits Insurgency in Nigeria has caused serious harm and retarded the growth of the economy, especially in the North-East	90	10	0	0	0	0	Strongly agreed
	Grand mean						4.2	Strongly agreed

Source: Research Field Survey (2019

Table 4.1.5 above shows that, most of the respondent strongly agreed that insecurity has affected hotel patronage.

Vol. 10, Issue 2, pp: (51-58), Month: April - June 2022, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

Table 4.2.3 Analysis on the efforts of government and private operators in ensuring security

S/N	Statement	5	4	3	2	1	Mean	Remarks
		SA	A	D	U	SD	X	
13	Improving city security through effective city planning design and governance	66	61	10	6	5	3.8	Strongly agreed
14	A community-based approach to improving city safety	70	42	10	21	8	4.0	Strongly agreed
15	Strengthening the formal criminal justice system polices	93	33	14	4	0	4.3	Strongly agreed
16	Reduction of risk factors	24	32	60	5	4	3.7	Strongly agreed
17	Non-violent resolution of conflicts	38	21	33	10	5	3.3	Strongly agreed
18	Strengthening of social capital	60	25	5	0	0	3.5	Strongly agreed
	Grand mean						3.7	Strongly agreed

Source: Research Field Survey (2019)

Table 4.1.7 from the above table, it shows that, most of the respondent strongly agreed that government and private operators has exerted efforts in ensuring security.

5. DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

The data-based analysis presented in 4.1.4 shows that respondents strongly agreed with the opinion (3.5) that the security challenges currently plagued northern Nigeria are negatively impacting tourism and hospitality agrees with Innocent, (2016) position. The analysis also revealed that respondents agreed (4.2) that, the apparent security challenges in northern Nigeria has caused a serious decline on patronage of northern hotels by tourists due to the insurgency of Islamic sect Boko Haram in line with Suleiman, (2015) deductions. They also agreed that, the security situation in Nigeria has become a major challenge to investors and the economics of the affected northern states. The analysis indicated that, the state of insecurity in northern Nigeria has negative impact to the growth and development of the affected states and the economy as a whole.

6. CONCLUSION

It is concluded that insecurity in Nigeria and Northern states in particular in recent times has affected the hospitality industry and the country in general as destination. There is the urgent need for government as well as the private sector in the country to evolve strategic and deliberate policies aimed at talking the menace of terrorism to its root. Unless this happen the country dream to have a robust hospitality industry cannot be achieved.

The study further reveals that insecurity has affected the hospitality industry greatly in Northern Nigeria. These effects have created a negative image for the country, slowing down development, it also revealed that the job creation for youth and individual in Nigeria are ways in tackling terrorism and thus saving the hospitality from the dangerous effect. However, the study shows that the efforts of Nigeria government in tackling terrorism are only fair and just. The study also reveal that government response to insecurity is very relevant to the hospitality industry as it will help in ensuring peace and safety of life and property as well as the host population, development and the growth of hospitality industry in the states and Nigeria as a whole.

Implications of the Findings

The implications of the findings of the research work are:

- i. That insecurity is a threat to the hospitality industry in Nigeria
- ii. That insecurity has enormous implication on the hospitality industry in Northern states and Nigeria as a whole
- iii. That terrorism is a global phenomenon that is experienced everywhere and not peculiar to Nigeria and northern states alone
- iv. That the ways out of the challenge of insecurity is through the job creation for unemployed youth and individual.

Vol. 10, Issue 2, pp: (51-58), Month: April - June 2022, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the findings of the study, the following are hereby recommended

- i. Government should put in place potent laws against sponsors and perpetrators of terrorist acts and see to the enforcement of the laws/legislations relating insecurity in Nigeria and northern states in particular.
- ii. There is also the need for government regulations of preaching in religious gathering by both Christian and Islamic preachers. Preaching which have the tendency to inflame or aggravate religious intolerance and tensions should be sanctioned.
- iii. There is the need for government to address the social-economic and political imbalances in Nigeria. The level of poverty, unemployment, ignorance, corruption in high places, bad leadership etc is high. Therefore, government should formulate deliberate policies which promote effective and efficient leadership good government, transparence as well as mechanisms to check and prevent corruption.

REFERENCES

- [1] Achumba, I. C., Ighomereho, O. S., and Akpan-Robaro, M. O. M. (2013). Security Challenges in Nigeria and the Implications for Business Activities and Sustainable Development. *Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development*, 4(2): 79 99.
- [2] Alemika, E.E.O & Chukwuma, I. (2012). *Analysis of Police and Policing in Nigeria*. Centre for Law Enforcement Education and National Human Rights Commission, Lagos. LGT Co, Ltd.
- [3] Amini, B. (2015) Agamenon R. E. Oliveira, *A History of the Work Concept: From Physics to Economics* (New York and London: Springer, 2014). *Advances in Historical Studies*, **4**, 336-337. doi: 10.4236/ahs.2015.44023.
- [4] Brokck, J. (2012). "Untold Story of how Boko Haram bombed UN House; The Nation Wednesday.
- [5] Brons, M.H. (2001). Society, security, sovereignty and the state in Somalia: from statelessness to statelessness? s.n.
- [6] Cooper, M., & Erfurt-Cooper, P. (2015). Health and Wellness Tourism: Spas and Hotsprings in *Aspects of Tourism*, No.40 (ChannelVision Publications, Bristol).
- [7] Dada, E.A. (2011). Resources management and food insecurity in Nigeria. Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development. Vol.2.No4. pp167-183.
- [8] Emmanuel, I.O., & Akintoye, E.O. (2019). Insecurity crisis in Nigeria: The Law Enforcement Agents a Panacea? Journal of Sociology & Social work, June 2019, Vol.7,1 pp44-51 DOI:10:15640/jssw.v7n1a6
- [9] Innocent, O. (2016). Insecurity contingencies for investment and employment. *The Punch*, Thursday, September 9, pp37-38.
- [10] National Population Commission (2006). National Population Census. Retrieved April 29,2020 from http://www.population.gov.ng
- [11] Ofobruku, S.A. (2013). Assessment of Leadership style among Hopsitality Business in Abuja. *Arabian Journal of Business Management Review* (OMAN Chapter). Vol.2,No.6.
- [12] Okonkwo, R.I. Ndubuisi-Okolo, P., Anagogu, T. (2015). Security challenges and theimplications for Business Activities in Nigeria. *Journal of Policy and Development Studies*. Vol.9, No.2
- [13] Rotimi, E. M., & Lawal, A. I., Obasaju, B. O. (2012). Towards achieving millenniumdevelopment goals (Mdg) in Nigeria: Prospect and challenges. *Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development*.
- [14] Suleiman, T. (2012). A Smell of Boko Haram, Tell Magazine, September 17, 46-49. The Hotels Nigeria Website Survey, 2019
- [15] Travel Jumia (2019). Hospitality Report Nigeria 2018. Vanguard, November 14, 2019.
- [16] United Nation Development Programme (UNDP) (1994). New Dimensions of Human Security. UNDP Report 1994
- [17] United Nation Habibat (2007). Enhancing Urban Safety and Security. Global Report on Human Settlement 2007, 2005, 1997. UN. Habitat. London. Sterling, VA
- [18] United Nation World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO) Annual Report 2011